
CITY OF KELOWNA

MEMORANDUM

Date: August 1, 2007
File No.: 5480-08
To: City Manager
From: Ron Westlake, Transportation Manager
Subject: **On street parking meter replacement**

Report Prepared by: Jerry Dombowsky, Transportation Demand Supervisor

RECOMMENDATION:

THAT City Council endorse the use of "Pay and Display" parking meters in on-street and off-street parking areas;

AND THAT City Council authorize the acquisition of the 51 "Pay and Display" parking meters that were part of the trial, at a cost of \$9,000 per unit for a total of \$459,000 to be funded from the Parking Reserve;

AND THAT the financial plan be amended to account for this acquisition from reserve funds;

AND FURTHER THAT Council direct staff to bring forward for reading considerations the requested definition amendments to Traffic Bylaw No. 8120, "Definition of a Parking Meter" and to Section 4.1.2 (h.h) "Expired Parking Meter", and the subsequent changes to Schedule 13 of the Ticket Information Utilization Bylaw No 6550; Appendix A attached to the report of the Transportation Manager dated August 1, 2007.

BACKGROUND:

In 2006, the City entered into a no risk trial of "Pay and Display" parking equipment in both on-street and off-street lot locations. The existing on street parking meters were aging and required replacement due to technological, financial management and practical issues. Purchase of replacement equipment was provided for in the parking management 10 year Capital Plan, through utilization of the Parking Reserve fund.

For the trial period, 50 Pay and Display machines were installed (with 1 spare) at various locations to test the technology and customer acceptance. After one year of operation, an evaluation has been completed with results as per below:

Coin Acceptance/ Miscredits

- Current coin sets are varied in terms of size and weight characteristics, making it difficult for older technologies to identify and credit coinage correctly – resulting in extreme customer dissatisfaction when errors occur. Foreign coinage and slugs account for an estimated \$500 monthly loss to overall on-street revenue while related service calls and out of orders are estimated to cost \$15,000 annually. The Pay and Display equipment, with its superior data capacity was able to identify virtually all coinage accurately. This dramatically reduced repair call outs, need to cancel tickets, and ensured audit ability of coin collections.

Vandalism

- Vandalism to parking equipment occurs in two forms – physical damage to the unit itself and vandalism of the coin mechanism. Physical damage to the Pay and Display units over the trial period was negligible. Unlike traditional individual meters, the Pay and Display stations proved to have virtually unbreakable displays, and graffiti removal is relatively easy. Throughout the year, a number of individual meter heads are invariably stolen or destroyed – something which was not a concern with the Pay and Display units. Coin chute damage, which is an ongoing problem both from a maintenance cost and loss of revenue position in traditional style meters was non-existent in the vandalism resistant Pay and Display stations.

Credit Card Capability

- Parking customers showed strong favour for the credit card payment option offered at the Pay and Display machines. Based on industry average, usage was much higher than expected. Typically, around 5% of transactions are credit card based, but in the Kelowna trial credit card usage averaged around 14% of all revenue. While some of the traditional style individual stall meters offer smart card compatibility, unlike credit cards administered by financial institutions, the programming, maintenance, selling and distribution of smart cards is a cost and resource concern, leading to the conclusion that credit card capability is a superior option.

Parking time Portability

- Based on user surveys, the ability to use time purchased at a Pay and Display machine at any City pay stall or lot was viewed as a significant attraction. Additionally, the survey revealed that a number of customers were not aware of this option which will lead staff to develop a better communication strategy on this feature.

Programmability

- Unlike traditional meters, the Pay and Display equipment is programmed not to accept coinage at times when parking fees are not in effect. This eliminated customer confusion as to whether payment is required after 6pm weekdays, on Sundays etc.

Paper Ticket

- Paper tickets from the Pay and Display equipment offer exact time of expiry which is seen as a benefit. Initially, negative comments were received about having to return to the vehicle to display the ticket in the windscreen. This soon dissipated and was not a significant comment in the detailed customer survey.

Out of Orders (OoO's)

- Wireless communication from Pay and Display equipment alerts maintenance staff to any problems with equipment e.g., out of orders, printing paper getting low, coinage vault full etc. As a result reduced "out of order" downtime revenue loss has become virtually nil. Revenue loss and maintenance overall for out of orders on old equipment is estimated at \$15,000 annually.

Coin Collection

- Fewer meters (22 vs. 173 on Bernard Avenue) and larger coin vaults resulted in significant time and cost savings for coin collection. Coin collection is bi-monthly vs. weekly or bi-weekly with traditional meters. Security and audit ability are vastly improved with the Pay and Display technology.

Financial Audit

- Accurate coinage credits and detailed collection reports provide superior audit control. Significant labour savings over individual meter data collection exists with the Pay and Display equipment.

Data Capture

- Unlike traditional meters, detailed revenue collection data is captured and stored automatically and retained indefinitely in a central computer data base. Similarly, out of orders and servicing

is recorded and retained eliminating the need for cumbersome and time consuming manual maintenance logs.

Aesthetics

- Pay and Display machines are at least 5 times more efficient in terms of valuable sidewalk space use. This allows for improved pedestrian mobility and facilitates sidewalk seating for cafes and restaurants. Given the possibility of upcoming streetscape improvements, the Pay and Display meters offer far more options for landscaping, street furniture, etc.

Cost

- Cost of Pay and Display equipment for Bernard Avenue is \$198,000 while replacement with single meters would be in the range of \$260,000.

Customer Survey

- In June 2007, an independent research firm conducted 200 on street interviews to gauge the level of support for Pay and Display meters. Overall, the majority of people (57.7%) of people surveyed were at least somewhat satisfied with the new "Pay and Display" parking meters with 44.8% being somewhat satisfied and 12.9% being very satisfied. About one quarter of respondents (23.4%) were not at all satisfied with the new parking meters.

In a related line of questioning, 27.5% of those surveyed either disagreed or strongly disagreed with having to pay for parking at all. Discounting the impact of these, the level of support for the Pay and Display equipment would be significantly increased above the 57.7% level.

Support

- Endorsement of the switch to Pay and Display equipment has been received from the Kelowna Parking Committee, the Downtown Kelowna Association, the Downtown Plan Committee, and various business owners and developers.

FINANCIAL/BUDGETARY CONSIDERATIONS: \$459,000 funded from Parking Reserve

INTERNAL CIRCULATION TO: Director of Finance

Considerations not applicable to this report:

LEGAL/STATUTORY AUTHORITY: N/A

LEGAL/STATUTORY PROCEDURAL REQUIREMENTS: N/A

EXISTING POLICY: N/A

PERSONNEL IMPLICATIONS: N/A

TECHNICAL REQUIREMENTS: N/A

EXTERNAL AGENCY/PUBLIC COMMENTS: N/A

ALTERNATE RECOMMENDATION: N/A

Given the above rationale, Council's approval is respectfully requested.

Submitted by:



Ron W. Westlake,
Transportation Manager

approved for inclusion:
John Vos
Director of Works & Utilities

Appendix "A"

Within Traffic Bylaw 8120, that the current sections regarding "Parking Meter" and "Expired Meter" be amended as follows:

That the definition of Parking Meter be changed to:

"Parking Meter" means a device that has been installed on or off a portion of a highway used to collect fees and either:

- (a) record time for parking of a Motor vehicle, or
- (b) Issue a ticket, showing the time of issuance and time of expiry, to be displayed on the dashboard of a Motor vehicle.

With respect to the "Expired Meter" offence in Section 4.1.2 (h.h), that the current (h.h) be renumbered "(h.h.1)" and the following be added;

"Expired Meter" (h.h.2) – On a highway, or public lot operated by the City, in a metered space governed by a meter that issues a ticket showing the time of issuance and time of expiry, after the time of expiry on the ticket displayed in or on a Motor vehicle in the metered space or, where no such ticket is displayed, in or on a Motor vehicle in a metered space.